

# The Council of Graduate Schools in the United States

One Dupont Circle, N.W. Suite 430 Washington, D.C. 20036-1173 Phone: 202/223-3791

January 7, 1982

Dr. Ernest L. Boyer, President  
The Carnegie Foundation for the  
Advancement of Teaching  
1785 Massachusetts Avenue, N.W., Suite 406  
Washington, D. C. 20036

*Rita*  
*\* Return*  
~~\_\_\_\_\_~~  
*my comments*  
*are attached*  
*Z*

Dear Ernie:

Enclosed you will find a copy of the steno typist's transcript of the panel session in which you participated during the 21st Annual Meeting of The Council of Graduate Schools. We shall greatly appreciate your editing of the pages on which your comments appear. (To facilitate this we have indicated on the first page of the transcript the page numbers on which your comments appear.)

In addition to publishing the report of the panel in the Proceedings of the 21st Annual Meeting we plan also to publish it as a separate "occasional paper" from the Council. We want to thank you in advance for your help in editing your remarks and returning the copy to us.

With all best regards.

Cordially,



Michael J. Pelczar, Jr.  
President

Trf

Enclosure

*\* Mailed 2/2/82*

**Affiliates:**

Conference of Southern Graduate Schools  
Midwestern Association of Graduate Schools

Northeastern Association of Graduate Schools  
Western Association of Graduate Schools

ORIGINAL

# Transcript of Proceedings

COUNCIL OF GRADUATE SCHOOLS

ANNUAL MEETING

PANEL DISCUSSION:

IS GRADUATE EDUCATION FULFILLING ITS RESPONSIBILITIES  
TO PRIMARY AND SECONDARY EDUCATION?

ERNEST L. BOYER

pages: 5-9  
50-51  
57  
59  
63-67

Washington, D. C.

Thursday, 3 December 1961

ACE - FEDERAL REPORTERS, INC.

*Official Reporters*

444 North Capitol Street  
Washington, D.C. 20001

NATIONWIDE COVERAGE - DAILY

Telephone:  
(202) 247-6700

1259 01 04

1 mqcDAV

1 Sitting next to Dr. Rutherford is Dr. Patricia  
2 Graham. She completed her undergraduate work at Purdue,  
3 received her Ph.D. from Columbia, and is also the recipient  
4 of several honorary degrees. She served on the faculty at  
5 Indiana University, Northern Michigan University, and  
6 Teachers' College at Columbia. She also has been Dean of  
7 the Radcliffe Institute and Vice President of Radcliffe  
8 College and then joined the faculty of the Harvard Graduate  
9 School of Education. A few years ago, she became under  
10 President Carter's Administration Director of the National  
11 Institute of Education. She currently is the Charles Warren  
12 Professor of the History of Education at Harvard and is  
13 serving as a fellow at the Woodrow Wilson International  
14 Center for Scholars.

15 I must add that there was an announcement  
16 yesterday that she has been named Dean of the School of  
17 Education at Harvard University.

18 (Applause.)

19 DR. SOLOMON: Dr. Boyer will serve as the  
20 moderator of this panel, so I'd now like to turn it over to  
21 him.

22 DR. BOYER: I was telling Mike before lunch that  
23 after he asked Pat Graham to join one of his panels, she was  
24 named dean at Harvard, and the rest of us are waiting to see  
25 what good fortune awaits us.

*Ace-Federal Reporters, Inc.*

444 NORTH CAPITOL STREET  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20001  
(202) 347-3700

NATIONWIDE COVERAGE

1259 01 05

1 mgcDAV

1 (Laughter.)

2 DR. BOYER: On behalf of my colleagues at the  
3 table, I should like to thank you ~~and the Program Committee~~  
4 for inviting us to discuss ~~with you~~ a topic that in some  
5 ways seems a bit ~~curious~~ and misplaced at a meeting of the  
6 Council of Graduate Schools.

7 Indeed, in looking at the title of this session,  
8 ~~which is posed in question fashion, I think~~ one might even  
9 ask the prior question: Is there a responsibility on the  
10 part of graduate schools towards secondary education? ~~I~~  
11 ~~think up~~ until recently, ~~if I might be so bold,~~ the  
12 condition of public education seemed far removed from the  
13 day-to-day agenda of graduate schools and their  
14 administration. Indeed, <sup>even today</sup> if we were to ~~provide a checklist~~  
15 and ask those in attendance how you would rank-order your  
16 worries day-by-day, I would be surprised if secondary  
17 education would even make it on to the paper.

18 I say <sup>this</sup> ~~that~~ not to be critical. There is, of  
19 course, a hierarchy of concerns in any administration, and ~~I~~  
20 ~~think~~ we begin our discussion today with the recognition  
21 that helping to strengthen, if not save, secondary schooling  
22 in this country is not the primary obligation of those who  
23 ~~are seeking to maintain and strengthen~~ <sup>direct</sup> graduate studies in  
24 the nation's distinguished universities.

25 On the other hand, I consider it a matter of

*Ace-Federal Reporters, Inc.*

444 NORTH CAPITOL STREET  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20001  
(202) 347-3700

NATIONWIDE COVERAGE

j259 01 06

1 mgcDAV

1 statesmanship on the part of this body that you have devoted  
 2 a session to reflect a bit on an issue <sup>that</sup> ~~which~~ quite frankly  
 3 will impinge on the health and well-being of us all.

4 Just a word or two to put the topic in  
 5 perspective. We have now approximately 45 million children  
 6 in the <sup>nation's</sup> public schools ~~or in education overall.~~ <sup>These students</sup> They move  
 7 along inexorably to what we call higher learning, and it's  
 8 absolutely clear, as night follows day, that the conditions  
 9 of schooling in the United States will inevitably determine  
 10 the well-being ~~and stature~~ of the nation's intellectual  
 11 community in the decades just ahead.

12 Second, you can't be alive and breathing in this  
 13 country without having some sense of concern about the  
 14 status of schooling in the United States. During my days in  
 15 government, I was much closer to the schooling picture, and  
 16 I left my federal post concerned, if not genuinely alarmed,  
 17 not just by what I thought were the internal erosions in the  
 18 schools, but perhaps even more substantial erosions ~~of the~~  
 19 public confidence in the ~~system~~ of public education.

20 ~~without much more than a guess and a few public~~  
 21 ~~polls, I speculate~~ <sup>suspect</sup> that the next ~~two to three~~ <sup>few</sup> years, ~~perhaps~~  
 22 ~~up to five,~~ <sup>will</sup> ~~may~~ be an absolute watershed in the nation's  
 23 strategies toward public education. ~~I think~~ there is an  
 24 anxiety and a lack of confidence <sup>in schools seems</sup> that ~~is~~ <sup>is</sup> much more  
 25 deepseated than at any time in my memory, certainly, and

*Ace-Federal Reporters, Inc.*

444 NORTH CAPITOL STREET  
 WASHINGTON, D.C. 20001  
 (202) 347-3700

NATIONWIDE COVERAGE

1 mgcDAV

1 perhaps in this century.

2           Somehow we have lost ~~our~~ confidence that schooling  
 3 represents America's most essential commitment. And ~~more to~~  
 4 ~~the point~~, added to that malaise is ~~now~~ a well-formed tactic  
 5 on the form of many to advocate options to public  
 6 education. ~~It seems to me that we~~ may have a dangerous  
 7 chemistry brewing, ~~where~~ <sup>At</sup> in the very time that our schooling  
 8 ~~system~~ seems to be under special stress, there is a growing  
 9 body of public support for the notion that we can, through  
 10 some yet unclear method, define an adequate option so that  
 11 we need no longer provide <sup>-at public expense-</sup> a ~~method of~~ universal and  
 12 equitable access to education.

13           ~~It seems to me if that~~ <sup>This movement</sup> ever takes hold firmly, we  
 14 will be left with a tragic two-part system -- the one  
 15 providing an escape for those who are more affluent and  
 16 clever ~~in our midst~~ while still tens of millions of young  
 17 people will ~~be left to~~ move through a system that ill serves  
 18 their long-term needs.

19           ~~One~~ final point. ~~and then I turn to the panel in our~~  
 20 ~~midst~~. We have, ~~it seems to me~~, a rather ~~disturbing~~ shift  
 21 in demography, ~~in which~~ <sup>increasing</sup> numbers of our young  
 22 people are, ~~in fact~~, a minority, with black and Hispanic,  
 23 ~~Americans still being a youth culture~~ while the majority,  
 24 white American is aging. And so we ~~have a problem~~, ~~it seems~~  
 25 <sup>have</sup> to me, not only a division in age ~~and a division of race~~

*Ace-Federal Reporters, Inc.*

444 NORTH CAPITOL STREET  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20001  
(202) 347-3700

NATIONWIDE COVERAGE

j259 01 08

I mgcDAV

1 but <sup>also</sup> perhaps a division of <sup>race and</sup> culture that could <sup>make</sup> ~~perhaps lead to~~  
 2 public schools as battlegrounds ~~based on very unfortunate~~  
 3 ~~lines which would be~~ rejected by those who historically have  
 4 the most affluence.

5 Only ~~27~~ percent of white Americans are 18 years of  
 6 age or younger, while 40 percent of Hispanics and a third or  
 7 more of all black Americans are 18 years of age or younger.  
 8 So the large majority of our urban schools increasingly are  
 9 a minority, and for these young people to be rejected as  
 10 public policy is to bankrupt the future of the country.

11 I say all of <sup>this</sup> ~~that~~ to say that as academic leaders,  
 12 graduate school deans, ~~with, if I might be so bold~~  
 13 Americans who care about the country — the agenda item this  
 14 afternoon is worthy of our investigation.

15 I <sup>Now</sup> ~~then~~ turn to our four panelists who come to us  
 16 with distinction and broad perspective. Each will speak in  
 17 turn, presenting a few moments at the speaker's stand, and  
 18 then we will have at each other following ~~these~~  
 19 presentations. And I urge that you have at us as well.

20 Pat Graham will be followed by Jim Rutherford, to  
 21 be followed by Dean Corrigan, to be followed by Greg Anrig.  
 22 We will hear from the panelists at this time.

23 DR. GRAHAM: Thank you very much. I might observe  
 24 that I prepared these remarks while I was still a professor,  
 25 and they may reveal a kind of irascibility that you as

*Ace-Federal Reporters, Inc.*

444 NORTH CAPITOL STREET  
 WASHINGTON, D.C. 20001  
 (202) 347-3700

NATIONWIDE COVERAGE

1 bwDAV

1 would be nice to have someone else say "That's a bunch of  
2 not very good academic work." My conclusion on that point.

3 My report for you today, and I hope you report  
4 this to your families. The report card of graduate  
5 education, your grades would be passing for undergraduate  
6 level but not for graduate degree. As the dean said to the  
7 promising student, "You have talent, but you need to do  
8 better."

9 Thank you very much.

10 (Laughter.)

11 DR. BOYER: You've been exposed to over 60 minutes  
12 of criticism, a failing grade. I feel you should be given  
13 at least 10 minutes to challenge your professors and  
14 critics. I will ask if you have any comments and criticisms  
15 You <sup>wish</sup> ~~have~~ to address to the panelists.

16 As I was responding to Greg, it's one thing for an  
17 audience to go home and say it to the public schools; it's  
18 quite another thing to tell them to go home and put a cap on  
19 the sociologists. It's impossible!

20 (Laughter.)

21 DR. BOYER: Do you have a comment or a question  
22 about this agenda? I will also allow panelists to add  
23 rejoinders.

24 Yes, please. I think this mike is live.

25 VOICE: Yesterday morning in the Washington Post,

*Ace-Federal Reporters, Inc.*

444 NORTH CAPITOL STREET  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20001  
(202) 347-3700

NATIONWIDE COVERAGE



1    bWDAV    1    there was a statement of Dr. Keyworth that the teaching of  
2                    2    science education, the funding of science education in this  
3                    3    country was largely ineffective. I don't remember the exact  
4                    4    words, but something like that. I wonder where he got that  
5                    5    idea, and for those of us who don't agree, I'm wondering if  
6                    6    there's anything we ought to be doing besides the usual  
7                    7    thing of attacking our congressmen and senators.

8                    8                DR. BOYER: Who'd like to comment on that? Jim?

9                    9                DR. RUTHERFORD: I've talked with Mr. Keyworth a  
10                   10              couple of times about the statements he's making.

11                   11              (Laughter.)

12                   12              DR. RUTHERFORD: I've been asking him what is the  
13                   13              evidence, what is the evidence it would take to say that,  
14                   14              for example, NSF programs weren't working? Student  
15                   15              programs, teacher programs. I'm still waiting for the  
16                   16              evidence. Clearly, he hasn't changed his mind on that  
17                   17              particular issue. I don't know how to deal with one  
18                   18              individual on that. I think most of you are responding to  
19                   19              Congress.

20                   20              But let me turn this around, however, and use this  
21                   21              as an example of how graduate education isn't quite up to  
22                   22              the job. During this period of nearly a year now when it's  
23                   23              been clear that the Administration mindlessly was going to  
24                   24              cut out an enterprise that goes back to 1950, that had its  
25                   25              ups and downs and the rest of it, the scientific community,

*Ace-Federal Reporters, Inc.*

444 NORTH CAPITOL STREET  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20001  
(202) 347-3700

NATIONWIDE COVERAGE

1259 05 01

kapDAV 1

DR. BOYER: I think the nub of this has to do with  
2 your focus on the arts and science, and indeed, does a dean  
3 in an arts and science graduate program have a direct  
4 relationship to this? I think that's an essential question  
5 that was asked, and I think that's fair enough, ~~except as an~~  
6 ~~individual.~~

7

Is there anyone who wants to respond to that?

8

I don't know why I am looking at you, Pat.

9

DR. GRAHAM: I think there is a responsibility for  
10 a faculty of arts and sciences, although I would repeat what  
11 I said earlier, namely, that I think that the faculty of  
12 arts and sciences' most important concern is not the  
13 improvement of elementary and secondary educational  
14 teaching. That is, I don't think that's what faculties of  
15 arts and sciences most importantly are about.

16

But I would think -- I recognize Dean Franklin's  
17 point about human nature. It is in fact very difficult for  
18 any of us not to think first of ourselves, particularly in  
19 times of scarce resources.

20

Having said both of those things, I think that one  
21 thing to say about a faculty of arts and sciences is  
22 that it will not get good students if the elementary and  
23 secondary schools are not producing good students. Some  
24 faculties of arts and sciences will. But on the whole,  
25 faculties of arts and sciences will not be getting qualified

*Ace-Federal Reporters, Inc.*

444 NORTH CAPITOL STREET  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20001  
(202) 347-3700

NATIONWIDE COVERAGE

1259 05 03

59

1 kapDAV 1 contributions to the high school -- nct, hopefully, at  
2 \$14,000 a year.

3 But I would hope some of these graduate students,  
4 whether they are finishing masters programs or  
5 Ph.D. programs, would enhance and make more lively the  
6 junior high schools and high schools in this country, and I  
7 would hope to see them there. I think the attitude of their  
8 faculty mentors dissuades some from -- who would be very  
9 good at that, from undertaking that activity, thus cutting  
10 off the schools from that source of good teaching.

11 DR. BOYER: We will have one more.

12 VOICE: It seems to many people that maybe the  
13 problem is wrapped up in the economics of the marketplace  
14 for teachers. Dr. Anrig made just one very brief little  
15 statement in passing that perhaps is something else that all  
16 the graduate deans and other deans might look at. That's  
17 the statement about funding through the local property tax.  
18 Maybe the place that arts and sciences areas need to get  
19 involved is with their economists or their business  
20 schools, or the political scientists, and the lawyers with  
21 the law schools, and those who might study 1st Amendment  
22 questions and the whole question of local control of  
23 education.

24 I'd like the panel to give us an idea why they  
25 think that that maybe is the place where we really need to

*Acc-Federal Reporters, Inc.*

444 NORTH CAPITOL STREET  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20001  
(202) 347-3700

NATIONWIDE COVERAGE

1259 05 07

63

I kapDAV

1 itself the teachers want this -- the state coordinating  
 2 board reduces the credit-hour payments for any course taught  
 3 off campus by 25 percent. The formula penalizes the college  
 4 for going off campus to make this element in the setting of  
 5 the school system.

6 These are problems which, it seems to me, have to  
 7 be reviewed and thought about for the whole university, not  
 8 just the college of education. I think probably the  
 9 agricultural model and the engineering extension model might  
 10 be something that deans of graduate schools could look at to  
 11 get over this dilemma of the FTE credit that's being talked  
 12 about here, but I don't think those are just problems for  
 13 colleges of education; they are problems for the  
 14 university.

15 DR. BOYER: I think the central message of the  
 16 session <sup>has been</sup> ~~was~~ to highlight a <sup>basic</sup> ~~broad~~ social problem that  
 17 inevitably impinges on colleges and universities, ~~that is,~~  
 18 schooling is in trouble, and that will affect us  
 19 professionally as well as individually.

20 Second, I was impressed in the discussion that, as  
 21 was just highlighted in the question, the status of teachers  
 22 and teaching, especially as that ties ~~is~~ to rewards and  
 23 remuneration, gets us close to the nub of the problem, and  
 24 that's an extremely complicated <sup>issue</sup> ~~one~~ that doesn't reside  
 25 <sup>essentially</sup> primarily at the university level.

*Ace-Federal Reporters, Inc.*

444 NORTH CAPITOL STREET  
 WASHINGTON, D.C. 20001  
 (202) 347-3700

NATIONWIDE COVERAGE

I kapDAV

1 I think when one advises students that teaching  
 2 may not be the best choice, that's not simply a matter of  
 3 building prejudice; it's reflecting some realities <sup>that</sup> ~~which~~ we  
 4 regret but are nonetheless there. So ~~I think~~ we kid  
 5 ourselves to try to gloss over what is really a very  
 6 important ~~social dilemma~~ <sup>fact</sup> regarding the support and the  
 7 financing of teaching in this country.

8 ~~We're~~, as you may know, ~~at the~~ <sup>the</sup> Carnegie  
 9 Foundation, <sup>is</sup> working on a report on secondary schools, and  
 10 it's very clear, ~~now that we're into this three or four~~  
 11 ~~months,~~ that the chapter we're calling the heart of the  
 12 matter has to do with ~~whether we are going to recruit and~~  
 13 ~~sustain and hold good~~ teachers. That's ~~in part~~ an  
 14 institutional problem, but in a broader sense it's a social  
 15 problem, ~~too~~.

16 All one can do is to try to touch the variety of  
 17 places where decisions about teachers are being made. Only  
 18 a few of those ~~or some of those~~ are on the college campus.  
 19 That's the second conclusion that I think we need to  
 20 candidly address.

21 Third, ~~and I thought it was vividly raised,~~ to  
 22 what extent does the structure called the graduate school  
 23 have a direct ~~agenda here?~~ <sup>responsibility for schools and teachers.</sup> That's why when I began I said  
 24 the ~~prior question is,~~ is there a responsibility? Well, I  
 25 ~~suppose honesty again would at least require~~ me to say I

1259 05 09

*That - except for schools of Education - it's a secondary*

I kapDAV

1 think ~~it's a~~ minor one. I am talking now of organization  
2 and structure. I am not talking attitude.

3 I do <sup>however</sup> think that graduate deans in the arts and  
4 sciences in ~~the ranking of academic life~~ carry great  
5 prestige and stature. because they speak for the disciplines  
6 that historically we have heard, and I think that's as it  
7 should be. *had doubt.*

8 ~~I only say that within that arena of debating over~~  
9 ~~priorities, I should think that the arts and science~~  
10 ~~colleges~~ <sup>do</sup> have, ~~it seems to me,~~ an obligation to help wrestle  
11 with the implications <sup>quality of education and use</sup> of where education fits, while the  
12 ~~constraints are being phased.~~ *their influence to support the schools.*

13 Also, I think that ~~brings necessary influence to~~ <sup>the institution (itself) should honor</sup>  
14 ~~the community at large more on the individual basis than~~ *teachers,*  
15 ~~perhaps institutionally.~~ I was struck that a distinguished  
16 institution in the country -- ~~you may think this an odd~~  
17 ~~footnote at the moment~~ -- but regularly ~~awards an~~  
18 honorary degree to the <sup>a</sup> ~~best~~ teacher of ~~their students~~ each  
19 year they can locate by ~~circulating opinions among students~~  
20 ~~and the like.~~

21 After they have honored a retired general and a  
22 well-heeled philanthropist who ~~has helped them,~~ they ~~are now~~  
23 ~~regularly giving~~ <sup>e</sup> recognition to a distinguished teacher. I  
24 mention that only <sup>illustratively</sup> ~~symbolically,~~ *perhaps, of course, of what*

25 Finally, I ~~do~~ wonder ~~in some of the~~

*university might  
do for  
State or their  
teaching.*

Ace-Federal Reporters, Inc.

444 NORTH CAPITOL STREET  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20001  
(202) 347-3700

NATIONWIDE COVERAGE

4 kapDAV

1 ~~interdisciplinary programs that are emerging~~, as Don Kennedy  
 2 mentioned the other day at our colloquium, ~~whether more of~~  
 3 ~~our graduate faculties might not be drawn together on~~  
 4 ~~certain~~ policy questions dealing with education. Don  
 5 Kennedy said at Stanford he could get 30 or 40 faculty from  
 6 other departments to look at questions dealing with health  
 7 policy, and he doubted he could get a third of that number  
 8 to come together ~~if you were to announce an~~ *to work on*  
 9 ~~interdisciplinary gathering around certain~~ education  
 10 policies.

11 ~~So I think~~ perhaps ~~secondarily~~ the arts and  
 12 sciences — to the extent that we cross discipline lines on  
 13 policy questions — might think of themselves as a  
 14 resource. *to the schools.*

15 I ~~mention those not to get overly defensive, but~~  
 16 *Simply stated,* ~~to acknowledge that~~ I think that in a day to day sense the  
 17 ~~question of the quality of the schools is not~~ *necessarily* at the top of  
 18 the graduate school administrative agenda, but ~~I think in~~ *I believe*  
 19 terms of influence and interdisciplinary actions there is a  
 20 strategic role to play. <sup>1</sup>

21 ~~I~~ <sup>I</sup> again wish to thank the planners of this  
 22 conference ~~that you~~ <sup>for</sup> invited us to explore the problem of  
 23 ~~teacher education with you, and the schools,~~ and I hope it  
 24 has been helpful.

25 Perhaps our main agenda has been to devote a few

*Ace-Federal Reporters, Inc.*

444 NORTH CAPITOL STREET  
 WASHINGTON, D.C. 20001  
 (202) 347-3700

NATIONWIDE COVERAGE

3 kapDAV  
1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

moments to try to get better understanding of the broader educational problem. I wish to thank the panel members themselves.

In the spirit of Greg Anrig, I would certainly give you a "A" for articulateness. I would give you a "A-plus" for insight. <sup>and common sense.</sup> ~~And in the spirit of your professorial roots, I would give all of you an "A" for~~ <sup>at least a "B" plus</sup> ~~longevity.~~

(Laughter.)

DR. BOYER: Thank you very much. The meeting is adjourned.

(Whereupon, at 3:45 p.m., the meeting was adjourned.)

\* \* \*